

GENERAL COMMENTS:

1. Digital images are viewed on a 32" Proart calibrated RGB photographic monitor.
2. Many portfolio's did not consider the story being told.

Set Subject

Portfolio

1. Is a collection of a photographer's best work.
2. is a carefully curated collection of a photographer's best work, showcasing their style, skills, and technical proficiency.

Series

1. Photographic series is a collection of photos that work together to illustrate a subject or tell a story.

Both

Selection of Best Works: Only top-quality images are chosen, representing various themes, techniques, or projects, depending on the photographer's goals. This selection emphasizes the photographer's skill level and artistic vision.

Cohesive Style and Theme: The portfolio often focuses on a particular genre (such as portrait, landscape, fashion, or documentary) or a specific style (such as black-and-white, high contrast, or minimalism) to create a cohesive presentation.

Organisation and Flow: Images are usually arranged in a way that guides the viewer's eye, creating a narrative or progression. This flow can tell a story, evoke emotions, or highlight versatility within a specific genre.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
1	377	EOY 24 Title- Feathered Friends		A simple header created by a single graphic the black text is non formal but the faint background text is a distraction, consider making the main text larger. The graphic suggests that the images will be about birds.
2	377	EOY 24 – Feathered friends		The Kookaburras has been placed centrally within the image with the vignette concentrating our attention on the subject. The diagonal branch creates a strong line and you have a good connection with the bird. The head feathers are a little over exposed so consider reducing the highlights and you may get the detail back.
3	377	EOY 24 – Feathered friends		A nice image of the white-faced heron stalking through the sticks. You have placed the bird's eye close to the golden ratio line with the neck and body on the Baroque diagonal and plenty of nose room. While the background is busy it does convey the bird's environment. The white face is over exposed so consider reducing the highlights.
4	377	EOY 24 – Feathered friends		Cartier-Bresson spoke of the decisive moment which you have captured here. The image is balanced with the water ripples creating a textured background. The eyes are not sharp suggesting that the shutter speed was too slow; looking at the metadata the shutter speed was 1/400s on a 300mm lens (450mm equivalent) so your shutter speed should have been around 1/450s yet top bird photographers recommend a shutter speed of 1/1000s for stationary birds.
5	377	EOY 24 – Feathered friends	C	There is a great connection between the birds which are sharp with good background bokeh separating them. The branch creates a nice anchor for the image but the image is not balanced with too much headroom; consider cropping the headroom and adding more space on the left.
		– Feathered friends		The obvious connection here is the birds. Consider reorganising the order heron, swans, lorikeets and kookaburra for a storied direction. The image format is not consistent and has no relationship to each image.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
6	325	Within 5 minutes - Title		A good capture of the rain on a window suggesting something about storms or rain. The text is soft and romantic suggesting staying in doors by the fire. The heading does not convey a message to the viewer.
7	325	2-portfolio 2024	HC	The rain water across the glass has been well photographed with some abstraction happening. The water creates a lovely sinister diagonal. The shallow DoF has blurred the background yet leaving enough context for us to understand the image.
8	325	3-portfolio 2024		A beautifully crafted image with the horizon placed low giving prominence to the clouds. The angle of the surf leads the viewer into the clouds; the white surf is a little over exposed; consider adding some shadow to the clouds to make them even more threatening.
9	325	4-portfolio 2024		The approaching storm is outlined in this image with the clouds appearing as huge wool packs. The image has many layers that lead us through the image with the grey being bordered by the sand and blue sky. Consider using the pro mode in your phone to select the appropriate aperture and shutter speed as 1/4400s and 1.8 aperture is not necessary.
10	325	5-portfolio 2024		The storm is over and things are settling down the light direction creates this sense of finish. Seaweed has been washed ashore by the storm. The water on the lens also creates this feeling that the storm has come and gone; but many judges will not like this so you might consider removing these distractions.
		Within 5 minutes	C	The connection here is the storm but you might consider re-organising the order to 4, 3, 2, 5 as this I think would create a story. While the image format is the same the image sizes are not.
11	326	From Behind - Title		This title page implies an old world feel to the following images, although the framing is off with more of the frame at the top and to the right; the text matches the border.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
12	326	2_From behind		A jewellery box shot from behind using a good DoF ensuring the subject is sharp while its reflection is out of focus creating a sense of depth. The foreground of soft feathers implies femininity, and the necklace leads us into the image. The background has been over edited in the black area.
13	326	3_From behind		An image of the toy car taken from the rear merged with a ¾ front view. The lighting has been well handled ensuring good exposure with no distracting highlights. The scrunched material creates a good background for the cars. The editing again has been over done creating distracting patches of black instead of a smooth transition, consider softening this by using a curves adjustment. The top right appears to have had something removed which bring attention to the pole. There are many good YouTube videos on how to remove objects and the edit images.
14	326	4_From behind		A portrait image of a rose from behind. The rose petals have been well photographed although the shallow DoF has cause some of the stalk to be soft. The petal texture is strongly evident creating a sense of the surreal. The background shows signs of over processing and here the petal edges exhibit a halo suggesting over sharpening; consider reducing the sharpening and remove it altogether from the background.
15	326	5_From behind		A portrait view of a man taken from behind and looking into a mirror. The partial rearview has a good connection with the frontal view with the scale of the rear view creating a sense of depth in the image. The image is soft possibly caused by the shallow DoF (f stop 4.4) and a slow shutter speed of 1/30s which is too slow for humans; the image also shows a fair amount of noise, suggesting global sharpening.
		From behind		This is a collection of images taken from the rear, the first two images are portrait and inorganic and the final two, landscape and organic. The series does not contain a story, but does it need to; possibly the series could be part of a larger exhibition.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
16	361	PRINT-Frozen in time title page		A striking image that is light with strong diagonals. The heading is placed in an area where it can stand out; using a traditional, formal serif font with the complimentary colours causing the eye to move around the image.
17	361	PRINT-Frozen in time 1		The stalks create strong diagonals to the focal points with the red blossoms standing out. The green background leaves creating a counterpoint to the blossoms; consider reducing the highlights to remove the formal shape.
18	361	PRINT-Frozen in time 2	HC	The frozen bubble creates a good backdrop for this flower while the ice cracking creates further interest within the image. You have placed the flower on the sinister diagonal and left enough negative space to balance the whole image.
19	361	PRINT-Frozen in time 3		Predominantly red flowers form the basis of this image with the crossed stalks creating a focal point behind the red flowers. Consider reducing the red channel saturation or vibrance slightly to eliminate some of the flaring.
20	361	PRINT-Frozen in time 4	C	A softly subtle image with a hint of the flowers in the ice. The green leaves stand out as a dominant shape while the flowers fade back into an almost abstract image. When removing element care must be taken not to have repetition as in the lower right corner.
		Frozen in time	HC	A series connected by the flowers in ice. All images are of a high quality, but their format and size are not consistent. While not telling a story these images would be well suited to a gallery exhibition.
21	399	Malley Birds 0 – Title page		The bird has been placed centrally within the image, separated from the background by a well chosen DoF. The text is a non-offensive sans serif font placed against a suitable background. Consider removing the diagonal stick as it does not serve a purpose on this page.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
22	399	Malley Birds 1		The log provides a good base for this image with the bird sharp and separated from the background by good bokeh. You have a connection to the bird, although consider increasing the brightness of the eye.
23	399	Malley Birds 2		Another good bird image with good separation. The branch has been placed on a strong Baroque diagonal with the bird on a sinister diagonal. Consider lifting the luminosity of the front of the bird and its face.
24	399	Malley Birds 3		This bird's attitude comes out in this image. You have done well to capture this bird as they are not easy to photograph. A good connection with the bird and even a catch light in the eye. Consider lifting the luminosity of the bird and darkening the background, also you might want to remove the stick on the right edge.
25	399	Malley Birds 4		Another top bird image, but this one is in motion. The image has been taken from a low perspective, creating an intimate image. The figure-ground relationship is low; the bird's native camouflage is designed to make it difficult to see in its habitat; consider lifting its luminosity and darkening the background to make the bird pop.
		Malley Birds		A series of superb bird images. While there is no story they do connect to the title page very well. Please note these images are all identical in size and would make a good beginning to a photobook.
26	431	Music for life 0 – Title page		A good title page implying the following images will be about music and a connection to a person's life. The font is a good choice as it conveys a theatrical impression.
27	431	Music for life 1		The trumpets are the heroes in this still life, with the sheet music creating an appropriate background. The glass and bottle add balance to the image although the bottle could be a little closer. The overlay is, I think a little heavy, consider reducing this slightly. I might have missed something but I'm

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
				not sure of the iconography of the vine; combined with the overlay, I feel they become distracting.
28	431	Music for life 2		A vanitas placed centrally in the frame with a plain black background. The two instruments create a triangular shape with the image accessories. There is a lightening, almost a glow behind the construction; this glow is too hard edged and needs to be soften by increasing the feather.
29	431	Music for life 3	C	A good monochromatic still life where a good connection has been made between the photo and the instruments. Good dodging and burning ensures the viewer is moved through the image by a well-chosen visual flow. The foreground mouth piece is probably not needed as it serves not purpose and is soft in its focus.
30	431	Music for life 4		A landscape image that has a connection to the title page by using the same backdrop; this image introduces a new type of instrument with a part of the body being cut off. The lighting and shadow have been well designed in this image.
		Music for life		This series is called Music for life and with the exception of the single vanitas, time or life has not been explored. The series is presented in the same format but the images are of different sizes although, all are of the same height and consist of two still life and two standard images. Individually the images are of high quality.
31	447	Flowers with filters – Title page		A simplistic title page consisting of a plain subdued yellow with white vignette and an uppercase, decorative font conveying a sense of whimsical fun. A photoshop filter has been applied to this page.
32	447	Flowers with filters - Sunflower		The triadic colours create strong image with the subject being framed centrally with the white vignette centring our attention. The split complementary colours of blue and yellow creates a high impact and contrast.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
33	447	Flowers with filters – Chinese Lantern		A darker more subdued colour combination that has been exposed with well designed lighting. The subject stands out from the good background bokeh, and the square format creates nice symmetry within this floral image.
34	447	Flowers with filters – King Protea		A nicely photographed Protea set against an explosion of green; the image is sharp with the filter enhancing this impression. The white vignette compliments the light flower colour.
35	447	Flowers with filters – Agapanthus Bud	HC	A beautifully photographed floral image with a softly faded green background that compliments the analogous colour of the flower. The centrally placed subject is well suited to the portrait format.
		Flowers with filters	HC	The series of floral image have all been beautifully photographed in sharp detail that has been enhanced by the soft photoshop filter. The first and last images are connected via the blue however the preceding images are all square format creating a sequence of symmetry and instilling a sense of expectation whereas the last image is portrait and this creates a jarring note; consider re-organising the sequence by placing the first and last image in the centre.
36	641	Vintage title page		An expectation of tradition has been placed on this series by the front page showing a series of antique objects, plus a theatrical serif font that screams tradition. Consider making the title page larger this will give the font more room.
37	641	Image 1		The chair and hat have been shot from a superior position reminiscent of old photographs. The image is rich in browns and yellows; consider converting this to a sepia format.
38	641	Image 2		The vanishing perspective leads us through this image that is mainly taken up by the wool bales; these do not imply antique although the tools do. Again an image that would do well in monochrome.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
39	641	Image 3		An image displaying a variety of antique object with two woman in period dress adding to the theme. The window could have been a problem but the vignette eliminates this problem. Consider moving to the left and using a wider focal length lens; this would avoid the candlestick being in front of the woman.
40	641	Image 4		A portrait image showing an old fireplace with appliances. The smoke blackened brick work adds character to the image creating a sense of history. The image was taken from a standing position level to the mantle, which needs to be straightened; consider lowering your shooting position to bring the kettle and fireplace into a more prominent position.
		Vintage		Thought has gone into the placement and format of these images as the portrait images are the same size as are the two landscape images. The old world theme connects these images and so does the heavy black vignette. Consider converting the images to monochrome and adding some grain to enhance the old feeling of this series.
41	852	Coober Pedy 01_ Title page		A different approach using the towns sign as the title page and taking it from a point of view implying the truck created the heap behind it. The font is an information light hearted font the competes against the title font, consider matching the fonts.
42	852	Coober Pedy 02		A panoramic image taken from a high vantage point showing the isolation and bareness of the location. Consider removing the caravan and vehicle on the edge of the image.
43	852	Coober Pedy 03	HC	The beautiful textured hills are juxtaposed with the white fluffy clouds in this image. You have foreground interest in the shrub and the expansiveness of the distant hills. The exposure is been well handled as there are not blown out highlights in the clouds. Consider using a soft Orton effect to enhance the dynamic range of this image.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
44	852	Coober Pedy 04		Another lovely landscape this time including some of the mining operations and taken during the golden hour. Compositionally the image is well balanced with a horizontal viewing direction. The foreground adds a nice base for the image but it is out of focus suggesting that the hyperfocal distancing was not used. An out of focus foreground can imply depth but in this case it is not necessary.
45	852	Coober Pedy 05		Another well shot panoramic image with the foreground and subject being complimented by the warm palette sky. The subject is a little too far to the left leaving a very large negative space, unbalancing the image, consider adding space to the left of the vehicle.
		Coober Pedy	HC	Four beautifully shot landscape image of Cooper Pedy present with a consistent white border and drop shadow and all images being a consistent size. All bar one image was taken at F9 creating a consistency within the images themselves.
		WSB1- image 1 (world series MotorBikes)		No title page. This is a problem when all other entrants are creating them as it puts you at a disadvantage.
46	855	WSB1- image 1	HC	This is a superbly shot and composed image with enough of the track and corner for viewer contextual information. You have captured the sparks coming of his knee and the concentration on his face. Consider lifting the exposure a little just on his face.
47	855	WSB1- image 2		Another good sports image, here you have captured the heat bloom from the exhaust and everything is pin sharp so your panning skills are advanced. I see that you are using an evaluative metering mode which tries to average out the exposure and in this case it has caused the background to be very bright causing a figure-ground relationship problem. Consider selecting the background and darkening it.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
48	855	WSB1- image 3	C	A Gestalt principle leads us through this image and the shallow DoF has created a sense of depth in the image. You have left nose room for the riders to move into. As with all racing shots the corners are considered to be where the action is but the images do not convey that sense of speed that the panned image on the straight does. Also the use of a high shutter speed also precludes this sense of speed, consider using a slower shutter.
49	855	xMoto2 - image 4		The rider in this image is pin sharp and the shallow DoF has ensured the background is non-distracting allowing separation from the subject. Consider lifting the luminosity of the riders face, also you might consider selecting the subject lifting his overall exposure and then darkening the background to make him pop.
		WSB1 (world series MotorBikes)		These are four superbly shot images; any of which would stand on its own in most competitions. As a group the differing sizes of the borders and the differing font and placement on each image is a distraction. Consider amending these and I'm sure these images would do well within the racing fraternity.
50	862	Outback night sky – Title page		Good positioning of the person at the base of the Milky Way. The text and position within the frame create a sense and exception within the viewer.
51	862	Uluru		In this image the horizon has been placed low giving prominence to the sky while the foreground provides a good base to the image. The horizon appears to have an upward curve suggesting that it needs a lens correction. The foreground has a muddy appearance, so consider editing this image to either bring out the landscape details or darkening the landscape to a silhouette.
52	862	Uluru 2		In this image you have captured the Milky Way in a vertical pose with some good potential colour within the stars. In this and the previous image you have set the shutter speed at 30s, this is too long to get the stars as spot and too

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
				shot for star trails, For your camera a shutter speed of around 12s to 15s will generate no star trails.
53	862	BankaBanka		A great idea light painting the foreground to create interest; here you have done well to ensure that the torch light is not too bright but has created a well exposed subject. However, I suspect that you have focused on the stars and not on the vehicle as all of the image is out of focus. Have a look at Richard Tatti's work; he takes multiple images, focusing on the foreground and then focusing on the stars and combining the images.
54	862	MaryKathleen		This image creates a sense of the moment; of camping in the bush and being around the campfire. The subject here are the fire and the people around it and their interaction with each other. The people are a little soft and I think this is caused by the 32 000 ISO, consider doing a noise reduction on the image.
		Outback night sky		You have linked the images to the title page with the series being about the night sky. There are many good YouTube videos on how to take and edit astronomical images.
55	866	Water in Motion 0 – Title page		The title page has a good well exposed image with the image placed on a plain background. The image is offset from the background and the unobtrusive text is also offset from the image creating a sense of uncertainty.
56	866	Water in Motion 1		The long exposure has created a sense of motion in the water with the rock pattern forming a strong triangular shape.
57	866	Water in Motion 2	C	A good long exposure image where the line of water leads us into the image from the left hand corner through the rising sun. The foreground rocks are sharp and the sky is not over exposed. Consider lifting the luminosity of the water as it is the hero in this image.
58	866	Water in Motion 3		The water motion creates dynamic movement juxtaposed against the solid organic rock. The light background and sky tends to balance the darker

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
				foreground with the white water grabbing our attention. The image appears to have been globally sharpen too much as there is a halo along the hill and the water appears crunchie; consider reducing the sharpness.
59	866	Water in Motion 4		A beautifully composed and shot image with the rocks leading us into the scene while the longer exposure water texture creates a contrast to the solid rocks, however the image appears to have excessive noise, possible caused by over sharpening but may have other causes, such as severe cropping.
		Water in Motion		A series that explores water movement around our coast although only one image showed wave motion. The series was presented in a consistent format except for the final image. Consider applying some thought to the subject matter and flow through the series.
60	875	Night Lights 0 – Title page		An offset graphic and text set against a hint of the subject to follow. The font is bordered in white creating a sense of highlight with the curvature suggesting the curvature of the earth.
61	875	Night Lights 1		The foreground has been well illuminated and exposure creating a strong foreground while still capturing the background aurora. Care needs to be taken when editing these images as slight subtle adjustments need to be made especially when there is red as this can become blocky and harsh very easily as it has done here; consider reducing the curves layer or saturation depending on what you have increased.
62	875	Night Lights 2		A good panorama showing the curvature of the aurora; the exposure has been well handled as the jetty lights are not over exposed. Consider dodging some of the right foreground to it with the other side.
63	875	Night Lights 3	HC	Another well captured aurora image with a sharp, subtly lit foreground creating both interest and a focal point. The grass is a strong triangular shape that does not detract from the light show.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
64	875	Night Lights 4		Another well shot and crafted image of the aurora taken with the moon included balancing the various horizon lights. The foreground has been illuminated but it is underexposed, so consider lifting the luminosity just in the foreground only.
		Night Lights		A series of well shot images of the aurora with no particular story, the sequence shows some thought as the first two images have human structures while the other two are natural landscapes.
65	884	Local Island Birds – 0 – Title page		A pleasant formal layout that has used a copy of the following images.
66	884	Local Island Birds – 1		A minimalist image plain textured background; a small corner flicker that needs to be removed. The bird has been placed approx. on the thirds lines. The background is tending to draw the eye so consider lifting the luminosity of the bird as the shadows are tending to push our eyes away to the brighter areas.
67	884	Local Island Birds – 2	C	The shallow DoF isolates this bird from the background, while the front log creates a good base for the image. The section to the right of the tree is a distraction so consider cropping it out.
68	884	Local Island Birds – 3		This image gives some good context for the birds environment although the bright spot behind the bird is drawing our attention. The bird is sharp and well photographed but consider removing the diagonal background branch.
69	884	Local Island Birds – 4		The bird has been centrally placed in this image and stands out from the background. A shallow DoF has been employed which has caused the birds face and beak to be soft.
		Local Island Birds		The birds connect this series of images all of which show a good skill level with most of them being shot at the birds level. All images are of identical size so the presentation has been considered.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
70	885	Wilson's Prom – Title page		A lovely aerial shot of the prom with the heading placed advantageously.
71	885	Wilson's Prom 1		A boat load of tourist coming back from a ride taken with a hill background. Consider lifting the luminosity of the subject to make it pop.
72	885	Wilson's Prom 2		A pleasant day at the beach with the image showing various activities at the prom. The image is a little over exposed as you have lost some details in the white water. Consider removing the sea gulls as they are too close to the edge or cut off. You have positioned the man on the bike very well and balanced him with the surfer.
73	885	Wilson's Prom 3	C	Nice surf lines lead us into this image where the walkers are the subject. The curve then brings us around to the headland and yacht. The impression of this image is that it was taken by a drone and drone are not permitted at the prom, however the metadata tells me it is not a drone so it was taken from a close vantage point using an 18mm lens creating a fine panorama.
74	885	Wilson's Prom 4		A lovely sunset shot taken from Pillar Point Lookout. The foreground and midground elements create really nice silhouettes for this golden hour image. Consider removing the edge flicker on the right. The horizon also requires a small adjustment.
		Wilson's Prom	C	A lovely series of images from around Tidal River showing various activities available in the area. The final image is I think well placed as is the two central images. Consider using another image as an early morning image to create a strong story line.
75	889	Backyard birds Title page		The image selection is very good; it's as if the bird is contemplating the title with an informal font standing out from the background.
76	889	Backyard birds 1		A great capture with the bird in flight against a non-distracting background and being framed by the leaves. There is a light area at the side of the bird which

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
				appears to be an editing issue although it does not appear anywhere else. Consider removing the two edge flickers/
77	889	Backyard birds 2	HC	A beautifully photographed wren that you have placed on the golden ratio line and framed by the leaves and grasses. There is a good connection with the bird and there is a catchlight in the eye. The grass creates a strong diagonal shape and even in the negative space there is a Gestalt principle at work to bring our eyes back to the subject. Consider removing the spot in the right of the image.
78	889	Backyard birds 3		The background bokeh separates the subject, being captured in an activity. The branch and bird form a strong triangular shape anchoring the image. The background is exhibiting excessive noise at 6400ISO suggesting that the image has been globally sharpened. Consider only sharpening the bird and not the background. Also noise reduction can be applied to the background.
79	889	Backyard birds 4		Another well photographed bird that is framed by the flowers with a well blurred background; the bird is sharp and well exposed but the image is again showing noise at an ISO of 12 800; the metadata does not indicate any sharpening has been applied, so it must be associated with the camera; consider using noise reduction to eliminate this
		Backyard birds	HC	Four stunning bird images, anyone of them could be a stand-alone image in any competition. The image portrait only birds found within the back yard
80	892	Phillip island at Night - Title		A well balanced image for the title page with a formal white italicised font placed in the right lower corner. Consider moving this text to the left side of the image as this is the darker side and it will not compete with the lighted building.
81	892	Phillip island at night 1		A moody long exposure shot with a good DoF ensuring the pier and the boats a sharp. The light reflection has lost detail and tends to drag the viewers eye

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
				before it gets to the subject, consider bracketing your shots and then merging them or alternatively you can use AI to remove the highlights.
82	892	Phillip island at night 2		An aurora image taken at Pyramid rock. The aurora is colourful and not overly saturated and you have created some foreground interest and positioned it well within the frame creating a line to your subject. However the foreground is dark so consider lifting the exposure here. The horizon has a curve and a lean so consider doing a lens correction and straighten the horizon as a tilted horizon in this instance is a distraction.
83	892	Phillip island at night 3		A lovely C curve takes us from the foreground past the building and on down the pier toward the glow on the horizon. The image has been well shot with no major highlight blowouts. There is a good tonal range within the light areas which is where most of the interest is. Consider cropping the right of the image to around the end of the pier as this will allow the eye to return to the beach via the light reflection.
84	892	Phillip island at night 4		A well exposed image using either an off camera flash or torch. The fall off of the light ensures our attention remains on the building with the night seeming to enhance the buildings isolation and abandonment.
		Phillip island at night		This series is called Phillip Island at night and while the early images have either been beach, town or iconic place this image does not indicate the island and could have been taken anywhere. Consider the story that you want to tell and the viewer that will be looking at your images.
85	870	Folio 0 – Title page		This title page sets the scene for the following images. The image is B&W and very grainy creating a sense of history and the old. The font also creates a sense that this is a personal history and has been handwritten. We can also see the building in the distance.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
86	870	Folio 1		This image is showing the decline of the gate post and has been taken in good light with the building in the background. The tilted horizon works here as it is a counterpoint to the post and is implying a slide into decay.
87	870	Folio 2		You are being watched by mum! This image is centred on the cows and with the shallow DoF blurs the background building, implying its disuse, neglect and irrelevance. Consider lifting the shadows on the cows to bring them even more forward in the image and making the building fade further into the background.
88	870	Folio 3		The first sharp image of the derelict taken on an overcast misty, moody day. The luminosity value across the image is consistent creating a flat image. Consider adding some punch by increasing the contrast, shadows and highlights of the building and decreasing the saturation of the background. There is a dust spot just above the horizon to the right of the chimney.
89	870	Folio 4		A wider view of the old building placing it in its environment. The overall image is centred on the building and has been taken from a position approximating the previous image. The birds are a nice touch in this image indicating that life goes on.
		The Homestead and the Decline	C	The first two images set the scene and timeline for this series with the B&W presentation; we then move into the coloured section with the third image maintaining the out of focus building. The fourth and fifth image is now sharp disrupting the derelict feel to the building and the historic feel of the series. The text in the last image is not necessary and is distracting from that image. Consider having all but the last image in B&W or Sepia with grain and then crop in closer but leave it in colour as this will represent the modern day.
90	896	Novice – Title Melb Zoo		The title page is a good idea and has been well exposed, giving the viewer an idea of what is to follow. You have applied blur to the background image but your selection skills need improving. Consider using object selection then

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
				contract the selection by about 2 or 3 pixels; you will then be able to edit the background consistently.
91	896	Novice 1 - Snow leopard		You have captured a good portrait of the animal and placed it in a strong position within the frame. Backlighting on light colour fur it is a good idea to under-expose slightly to ensure you do not lose detail in the highlights.
92	896	Novice 2 - Orangutan		This is a nice centrally framed portrait with a good connection to the photographer. The image is sharp but is over-exposed a little creating a washed-out colour. Consider editing the image to bring the colour back into the fur; lift the contrast, saturation, vibrance, then lift the exposure and contrast to just the eyes.
93	896	Novice 3 - Gorilla		A well framed portrait with a good connection and expression in this sharp image. Use the histogram on the back of your camera to ensure that you expose for the highlight to ensure they do not lose detail. If this is shot in RAW you may be able to recover the highlights.
94	896	Novice 4 – Baby Gorilla	C	The baby Gorilla taken from an inferior position giving dominance to the animal. The body and head position create some strong diagonals. Darken the cheek a little to bring back some of the details.
		Melb Zoo	C	A good series of images that are link to the Zoo. Most of the images are approaching the square format; consider using the ration selection when cropping image to ensure that your images are square. Square image are very useful for centrally framed subjects as it imparts symmetry on the image.
95	869	Insect life Title page		A well crafted front page with consistent borders and the informal heading font stands out. The lines are all leading left to right but you might rotate the images to have the insects moving into the centre.
96	869	PRINT insect life 1		The rich lavender colour stands out on the flower and the bee is pin sharp with great detail and colour. The background is non intrusive and is separated

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for – Dec 2024- Subject – PORTFOLIO - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
				by a well chosen aperture. You might consider removing the bottom petal but it is a minor thing.
97	869	PRINT insect life 2		A fine macro shot with high detail in the insect hairs taken from a low position showing the underside of the insect; this is a prized position and generally scores extra marks.
98	869	PRINT insect life 3		The same bug taken from a different position using what appears to be a ring flash which you might try to minimise. The insect has been placed in a strong position within the image and the rule of space has been obeyed.
99	869	PRINT insect life 4	HC	Another fine macro where the flash is not as intrusive on the shiny body. The head and eye details are superb. Have a look at your jpeg conversion as there is some very slight banding just above the insects back when I view this on a high end monitor.
		insect life	HC	Four very accomplished macro images displaying a high skill level. The image subjects link and the landscape format image are all identical in size.